

2019 Meeting Minutes

Members present (by phone): Amanda Guercio (Chair) [ACG], Blake Mann [BAM], Barbara Charlton (voting member and assistant secretary) [BNC], Donald Sutherland [DAS], Ken Burrell [KGB], Reuven Martin [RDM], Bill Lamond [WGL], Daniel Riley (Secretary) [DJR], Mike Burrell (archivist) [MVB]

Agenda:

1. Call to Order – ACG called meeting to order at 0900
2. Minutes of the 2018 OBRC AGM – ACG: noted a typo in Mark Read's name. ACG: motion to approve. Vote: 7-0 in favour.
3. Business arising from 2017 AGM:
 - a. MVB: noted that he and Josh Vandermeulen had intended to send out an Ontbirds email to give birders an overview of how to submit OBRC records using eBird data, what is required at a minimum. They will be following up on this in the coming year.
4. Third round voting: discussion
 - a. 2019-052 Western Kingbird – The consensus seems to be that this is in fact a Western Kingbird and the new photo supports ruling out Cassin's Kingbird. Vote: 7-0-0. Accepted.
 - b. 2019-073 Barnacle Goose – Discussion about how habitat may influence the origin of the Barnacle Goose. DAS provided a photo of the habitat where the Barnacle Goose was observed. Seems to be that the bird was only present at that location with a very small number of CANG. These CANG are typically residents and it is unlikely the flock would have been comprised of arctic migrants. MVB notes that this record would represent the first accepted Barnacle Goose in Ontario. WGL notes that the time of year matches the vagrancy trend in Barnacle Goose well. Based on Mike's updated analysis on habitat and flock composition the consensus is that this record should not be accepted based on origin. Vote: 0-0-7. Insufficient evidence.
 - c. 2019-077 Blue Grosbeak – Discussion surrounding the 3rd party nature of this report, particularly based on past voting with regards to 3rd party submitted records. Considerable discussion on what constitutes a 3rd party record (e.g. eBird reports?). MVB recommends that this record be voted on now, Tom Wheatley can be informed that the record can be resubmitted in a subsequent year with the email directly from the observer attached as "new information". Vote: 1-6-0. Insufficient evidence.
 - d. 2019-134 Chuck-will's-widow – WGL indicates willingness to change his vote based on the known presence of CWWI in the area. RDM feels that the record does not provide enough detail. Vote: 6-1-0. Accepted.
 - e. 2019-143 Wood Stork – Many members of the committee feel strongly about this record, and the quality of the report in relation to the significance of the record. Most members are unwilling to change their vote on this record. Vote: 3-4-0. Insufficient evidence.

5. Other records to discuss (# of individuals)
 - a. 2019-108 Pink-sided Junco – Vote to accept only one bird: 6-1-0.
 - b. 2019-118 Arctic Tern – 16 or more birds were reported by the observer, 12+ of these were heard at night. Vote to accept 4 birds only: 7-0-0.
6. Updates to Bylaws
 - a. KGB: Proposal to change to the OBRC's policy's pertaining to the South Review List and definitions for review species, replacing Section 6.2.4.1 with the following (yellow is new):
 - i. "South Review List – As a guideline, species on the South Review List are recorded less than 20 times per five-year period on average. For irruptive species that exceed this total in a single year, they must be recorded in at least three of the five years in the period. Any species that clearly exceeds this number in a five-year period but lacks proper documentation for the records may be deleted from the list at the discretion of the committee.
 - ii. Any species with more than 100 records may be deleted from the South Review List at the discretion of the committee. Species removed from the South Review List under this caveat are species that have a long-established pattern of vagrancy."
 1. Some disagreement on this as over time many species will eventually meet this threshold. DAS proposes that all Review Lists be included under this clause if it passed. Discussion on proposed Bylaw amendments. Vote: 2-6. Not passed.
7. Motions to add/remove species from review lists:
 - a. MVB: Remove Arctic Tern from the South Review list
 - i. If successful, make this change retroactive to 2015
 - ii. MVB: presented a spreadsheet (see appendix) showing OBRC and eBird records of this species. In the past five years, the OBRC has accepted 14 records, and there are at least 24 additional credible records in eBird. While Ottawa accounts for the bulk of records, there are records from the past five years from Halton, Niagara, Norfolk, Northumberland, Parry Sound, Prince Edward, Renfrew, and Toronto. Noted that observers in the Ottawa area often will not submit reports for this species to OBRC as it is not reviewed by the Ottawa Bird Records Committee.
 - iii. MVB: motion to remove Arctic Tern from the South Review list, seconded by BNC. Votes: 8-0 motion passed.
 - iv. MVB: motions to make change retroactive to 2015, seconded by DAS. Votes: 8-0 motion passed.
 - b. KGB: Remove Mississippi Kite from the South Review List. Presented list of 20 records from the period 2014-2018 (see appendix). Noted that this species has really increased in the past decade in Ontario.
 - i. KGB motion to remove MIKI from South Review List, seconded by DJR. Votes: 2-6 motion not passed.

- c. KGB: Remove Henslow's Sparrow from the South Review List. Presented a list of 19 records during the period 2014-2018 (17 OBRC accepted records, plus 2 non-reviewed records; see appendix). Some discussion about the species population trends outside of Ontario. DAS stated that numbers have increased in Indiana, Illinois, Ohio thanks to American federal program to subsidize farmers who put land into conservation, but this program has recently come to an end. MVB: pointed out that in the most recent five years, the number is much lower (2014 and 2015 were big years).
 - i. KGB motion to remove HESP, DAS seconded. Votes: 1-7
- d. KGB: Remove Blue Grosbeak from the South Review List. Presented list of 103 records (see appendix) to use 100+ records criteria.
 - i. Motion withdrawn by KGB.
- e. KGB: Remove the following species from the Central Review List. Important to understand that the next Breeding Bird Atlas is starting in 2021 and there will be much more coverage in the north
 - i. Mute Swan (4 accepted records in past five years; see appendix).
 - 1. KGB motion remove, seconded by DJR. Votes 1-7. Not passed.
 - ii. Willet (7 accepted records in past five years; see appendix). Many members felt this species would be reported much more regularly if there were better coverage, especially around Rainy River.
 - 1. KGB motion to remove, seconded by BAM. Votes 7-1 (DAS voted no). Passed.
 - iii. Carolina Wren (5 accepted, 3 not reviewed; see appendix). WGL asked if the records were summer/breeding records. MVB: no, mostly fall records. Most of the reports are at feeders outside of breeding season; don't see how breeding bird atlas would greatly increase this number.
 - 1. KGB motion to remove, seconded by BNC. Votes: 3-5 (BNC, KGB, DLR voted yes). Not passed.
 - iv. Western Tanager (6 accepted, 2 not reviewed; see appendix). Some discussion around when/where they show up – mostly in spring migration at feeders. Not too likely to be over-looked, or to see big uptick in reports in future
 - 1. KGB motion to remove, seconded by DAS. Votes: 2-6 (KGB, DLR voted yes). Not passed.
 - v. Dickcissel (6 accepted, 2 not reviewed; see appendix).
 - 1. KGB motioned to remove, seconded by BAM. Votes: 2-6 (KGB, DJR voted yes). Not passed.
- 8. Other agenda items
 - a. MVB: Discussion regarding assembling records and gathering of information
 - i. Discussion regarding dividing the secretary's tasks amongst other members of the OBRC. MVB pointed out that the secretary's duties have grown substantially since OBRC was formed. Used to be just assembling records and sending them out. Now, tasked with managing email account, gathering information, chasing records down, plus the amount of

documentation is likely 10-40 times more than it was even very recently (thanks in part to digital media). MVB proposed either having voting members all take on preparing a package or else splitting off some of the extralimital duties the secretary is currently performing and having each member take on one role. The consensus was the latter approach would be favoured. MVB will draft a document outlining the issue and the proposed solution, with a list of tasks. 2020 can be a trial year before drafting some text for the bylaws.

- b. MVB: OBRC archives update and discussion
 - i. MVB and volunteers have been scanning OBRC records at the ROM for a number of years. Currently has about 20 volunteers helping with cleaning/collating the existing scanned documents. MVB is looking for help with this latter task. Scanning will pick up again once the pandemic is over. There are still many reports to scan (and all of the media), but getting the existing scanned documents properly curated is necessary to understand how much is still to be done. MVB mentioned the goal of having the OBRC database up online with a way to open up digital documentation where it exists. Some discussion about making records public. Consensus was that “insufficient evidence” records shouldn’t be posted. DAS raised the point that doing this retroactively could upset some previous submitters.
 - c. ACG: Correction to the naming system used in the annual reports (Jean Iron and Ron Pittaway)
 - i. “We suggest that OBRC change First Basic to Formative in future reports to be consistent with the annual report Introduction: “Plumage terminology uses the modified Humphrey and Parkes (1959) system following Howell (2010)”. (this is already in the by-laws 6.8.2.1)
 - 1. MVB stated that this would have been an error with particular records and is something to be corrected in the 2019 report
 - d. ACG: Ontario Checklist. ACG looking for assistance with updating the Ontario Checklist.
 - i. KGB will provide information to ACG in an email.
 - e. DJR: Passwords.
 - i. DJR noted that passwords for the OBRC members only and gmail account should be updated on an annual basis. General agreement from the rest of the committee.
 - f. Third part reports: As a follow-up to the discussion under the Blue Grosbeak record earlier, DAS and BNC agreed to write up a proposal for how to handle third party reports. Will be drafted then circulated to the 2020 committee.
9. Division of letters of review for insufficient evidence records among voting members
- i. Members to send their letters back to Chair, who will then send out the letters formally, ahead of the Annual Report in the August issue of Ontario Birds. Aiming for late April.
- b. 2019-004 Black Swift -BNC

- c. 2019-010 Chuck-will's-widow - ACG
 - d. 2019-030 Little Blue Heron - ACG
 - e. 2019-040 Scissor-tailed Flycatcher - DAS
 - f. 2019-056 Western Sandpiper - WGL
 - g. 2019-059 Western Sandpiper -WGL
 - h. 2019-073 Barnacle Goose – letter not necessary
 - i. 2019-074 Bell's Vireo - WGL
 - j. 2019-077 Blue Grosbeak - RDM
 - k. 2019-083 Carolina Chickadee - ACG
 - l. 2019-092 Great-tailed Grackle -BNC
 - m. 2019-103 Mississippi Kite -BNC
 - n. 2019-117 Yellow-crowned Night-Heron - BAM
 - o. 2019-123 McCown's Longspur - BNC
 - p. 2019-128 Tropical Kingbird - BAM
 - q. 2019-147 Lazuli Bunting - BAM
 - r. 2019-143 Wood Stork - RDM
10. Division of age/sex/plumage of each record –
- a. ACG will take care of this and circulate all records to the Committee for a general consensus.
11. Timeline review for Annual Report to meet August issue of *Ontario Birds*.
- a. Deadline is the end of May, end of April is the target for first draft to be sent out to the committee.
12. 2019 Bird of the Year voting.
- a. Both Black-throated Sparrow records will be credited with bird of the year.
13. Election of 2019 committee
- a. BAM, DAS and WGL are completing their terms.
 - b. 2019 nominees: Mike Burrell, Bruce Di Labio, Brett Fried, James Holdsworth, Mark Read, Adam Timpf
New members (3): 6 excellent candidates were nominated. Amanda to contact elected candidates. Top 4 based on member voting:
 - i. Mark Read
 - ii. Adam Timpf
 - iii. Mike Burrell
 - iv. Brett Fried
 - c. Secretary: Daniel Riley motioned by ACG: Voting: 8-0
 - d. Assistant to the Secretary: Barb Charlton to continue motioned by ACG: Voting: 8-0
 - e. Chair: Amanda Guercio to continue as chair: Voting: 8-0.
 - f. Archivist: Mike Burrell to continue, motioned by ACG. Voting 8-0.
14. Adjourn: 11:47

OBRC AGM – April 4, 2020

Appendix 1: Arctic Tern records from 2015-2019 prepared by Mike Burrell

Source	Location	date start	#	Reporter
2018-006	Oakville, Halton	5-7 June 2018	1	Dominik Halas, Robert H. Curry, Sarah E. Lamond
2019-002	Duffy, Niagara	27 October 2019	1	Ryan Griffiths
2017-005	Long Point (Tip), Norfolk	27 October 2016	1	Liam D. Curson, Anna Rodgers
2019-069	Long Point 'New' Park, Norfolk	16 May 2019	1	Ron Ridout
2016-005	Cobourg, Northumberland	23 June-2 July 2016	1	Clive E. Goodwin, Luke H. Berg, David I. Pryor
2017-006	Cobourg, Northumberland	28 May 2017	1	R. Douglas McRae, David I. Pryor, Charmaine M. Anderson, Garth V. Riley
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	21 May 2015	4	Nicholas von Maltzahn
2015-076	Britannia, Ottawa	26 May-1 June 2015	5	Mark A. Gawn, Mark J. Patry
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	26-28 May 2015	4	Mark Patry, Mark Gawn, Mike Tate, etc.
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	30 May 2015	16	Bernie Ladouceur, Mike Tate, Mark Gawn etc.
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	31 May 2015	5	Richard Waters, Aaron Hywarren, etc.
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	01 June 2015	4	Mark Gawn, Richard Knapton, Lev Frid, etc.
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	05 June 2015	1	Aaron Hywarren, Mike Tate
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	08 June 2015	2	Mark D. Read, Dan Riley, etc.
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	23 May 2016	4	Michael Tate
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	24 May 2016	2	Rick Collins, Sue&Gary Milks
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	26 May 2016	1	Gregory Zbitnew
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	27 May 2016	2	Judith Allanson
eBird	Shirley's Bay, Ottawa	01 June 2016	2	Rob Pinilla, Amber Bonvie
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	02 June 2016	2	Richard Waters
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	04 June 2016	2	Richard Skevington, Gregory Zbitnew
2016-081	Britannia, Ottawa	06 June 2016	1	Michelle A. Martin, Mark A. Gawn, Paul A. Martin
2016-080	Britannia, Ottawa	06 June 2016	1	J. Michael Tate
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	07 June 2016	1	Aaron Hywarren
eBird	Constance Bay, Ottawa	31 May 2017	1	Jeff Skevington
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	02 June 2017	2	Aaron Hywarren
2017-125	Twin Elm, Ottawa	06 June 2017	1	Jon P. Ruddy
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	10 June 2017	4	Michelle Martin, Paul Martin
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	11 June 2017	2	Mark Gawn, Michelle Martin
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	12 June 2017	2	Mark Gawn

OBRC AGM – April 4, 2020

2018-007	Britannia, Ottawa	03 June 2018	1	Jon P. Ruddy, Brian L. Morin, Vincent Fyson, Alice Tremblay
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	04 June 2018	1	Michelle Martin, Mike Tate, Mark Patry, Jon Ruddy
eBird	Britannia, Ottawa	06 June 2018	1	Brandon P.M. Edwards, Aaron Hywarren
2019-071	Lincoln Heights, Ottawa	31 May-1 June 2019	2	Michelle A. Martin, J. Michael Tate
eBird	Lake Bernard, Parry Sound	25 May 2018	25	Stephen O'Donnell
eBird	Smokes Point, Prince Edward	30 May 2015	1	Doug McRae
2019-118	Lake Traverse, Renfrew	26-27 October 2011	16	Jeffrey H. Skevington
2019-138	Regent Park	23 May 2019	1	Ruth Danella

Notes:

OBRC-accepted: 14

eBird: 24 (minimum)

Appendix 2: Mississippi Kite records from the South Review Zone for 2014-2018 prepared by Ken Burrell

Location	Date Start	Date End	Notes
Simcoe	11 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	13 May 2014	14 May 2014	Accepted by OBRC
Wheatley	14 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Long Point (Breakwater)	14 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Long Point Provincial Park	18 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	19 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Erie View	24 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Hillman Marsh Conservation Area	15 May 2015	16 May 2015	Accepted by OBRC
Brantford	22 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Clarke's Corners	23 May 2015	24 May 2015	Accepted by OBRC
London	23 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	13 May 2016	15 May 2016	Accepted by OBRC
Rondeau Provincial Park	13 May 2016	15 May 2016	Accepted by OBRC
Port Colborne	19 May 2016	23 May 2016	Accepted by OBRC
Rondeau Provincial Park	22 May 2016		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	28 May 2016		Accepted by OBRC
Pelee Island	17 May 2017		Accepted by OBRC
Dealtown	19 May 2017		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	11-May-18		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	16-May-18		Accepted by OBRC

Total records: 20

Appendix 3: Henslow's Sparrow records from South Review Zone from 2014-2017 prepared by Ken Burrell

Location	Date Start	Date End	Notes
Point Pelee National Park	17 April 2014	18 April 2014	Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	04 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	04 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Port Glasgow	11 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	17 May 2014		Accepted by OBRC
Caledon	25 June 2014	14 July 2014	Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	17 April 2015	19 April 2015	Accepted by OBRC
Port Glasgow	21 April 2015	24 April 2015	Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	04 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	05 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	11 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Harrow	14 May 2015	16 May 2015	Accepted by OBRC
Wheatley	20 May 2015		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	05 May 2016	07 May 2016	Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	26 May 2016		Accepted by OBRC
Point Pelee National Park	29 April 2017	01 May 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Union	October 29 2017		Accepted by OBRC
Peel Region	2014-07-03	2014-07-14	NHIC database
Halton Region	2017-05-27		NHIC database

Total Records: 19

OBRC AGM – April 4, 2020

Appendix 4: Mute Swan records from Central Review Zone from 2017-2018 prepared by Ken Burrell

Date	Date End	Location	Notes
30 May 2017	13 June 2017	Porcupine Lake	Accepted by OBRC
14 July 2017	15 July 2017	Dorion Landing	Accepted by OBRC
29-Jun-18	08-Jul-18	Thunder Bay	Accepted by OBRC
19-Aug-18	03-Nov-18	Thunder Bay	Accepted by OBRC

Total Records: 4

OBRC AGM – April 4, 2020

Appendix 5: Willet records from Central Review Zone from 2015-2019 prepared by Ken Burrell

Location	Date	Notes
Thunder Bay	05 June 2015	Accepted by OBRC
New Liskeard	13 May 2016	Accepted by OBRC
Hearst	04 June 2017	Accepted by OBRC
New Liskeard	06 June 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Thunder Bay	23-May-19	Accepted by OBRC
Little Pigeon Bay, Thunder Bay	05-May-18	Accepted by OBRC
Hurkett, Thunder Bay	20-May-18	Accepted by OBRC

Total Records: 7

Appendix 6: Carolina Wren records from Central Review Zone from 2016-2019 prepared by Ken Burrell

Date	Location	Observers	Notes
09-Jan-17	Thunder Bay	Bill Greaves	Not submitted to OBRC
December 20, 2016 - January 15, 2017	Thunder Bay	Mobs	Not submitted to OBRC
October 26 2017 - November 30, 2017	Thunder Bay	Mobs	Not submitted to OBRC
October 8, 2016 - December 2016	Timiskaming	Serge Gendron	Accepted by OBRC
October 13, 2017 - November 24, 2017	Timiskaming	Serge Gendron, Michael Werner	Accepted by OBRC
August 27, 2018 - October 6, 2018	Timmins	Roxanne Filion	Accepted by OBRC
27-29 July 2019	Timmins	Roxanne Filion	Accepted by OBRC
09 December 2019	Cochrane	Linda Audette	Accepted by OBRC

Total Records: 8

Appendix 7: Western Tanager records from Central Review Zone from 2015-2019 prepared by Ken Burrell

Date	Location	Observers	Notes
05 May 2015	Dorion	Norma J. Maurice	Accepted by OBRC
15 May 2015	Manitouwadge	Tammie B. Hache	Accepted by OBRC
14-18 May 2016	Thunder Bay	John M. Woodcock, Maureen E. Woodcock	Accepted by OBRC
04 June 2017	Kama Point, Nipigon	Elizabeth M. Kerr, A.D. Belmont Kerr	Accepted by OBRC
22-23 May 2018	Thunder Bay	Kelley Sutton	Accepted by OBRC
15-May-17	Thunder Cape	TCBO banders	Not reviewed by ORBC
05-Jun-17	Thunder Cape	TCBO banders	Not reviewed by ORBC
14-15 July 2019	Fort Frances	Shirley Skirten	Accepted by OBRC

Total Records: 8

OBRC AGM – April 4, 2020

Appendix 8: Dickcissel records from Central Review Zone from 2017-2019 prepared by Ken Burrell

Location	Date Start	Date End	Notes
Porcupine, Cochrane	17 May 2017	19 May 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Sistonens Corners, Rainy River	20 May 2017	22 May 2017	Accepted by OBRC
Rainy River, Rainy River	20 June 2017	08 July 2017	Accepted by OBRC, multiple birds
Rainy River, Rainy River	21-Jun-18	29-Jun-18	Accepted by OBRC
Sable Islands, Rainy River	08-Jun-19	08-Jun-19	Accepted by OBRC
Rainy River, Rainy River	09-Jun-19	09-Jun-19	Accepted by OBRC
Thunder Cape Bird Observatory	05-Sep-17	05-Sep-17	Not reviewed by OBRC
Sioux Lookout	04-Jun-18	04-Jun-18	Not reviewed by OBRC

Total Records: 8